

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

IMPACT OF TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT ON EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE

Shahid Ghori

Scholar, Department of Business Administration, the Islamia University of
Bahawalpur (Bahawalpur)

Anum Ijaz

Research Scholar, Department of Business Administration, the Islamia University of
Bahawalpur (Bahawalpur)

ABSTRACT

T&D is an important factor in improving human performance and organizational success, while maintaining a competitive edge. The purpose of this study is attempting to explore the relationship between T&D programs and employee performance in management sciences. A combination of surveys and interviews was used to collect information from employees in organizations. Research has found a positive link between well-designed T&D programs and enhanced employee performance (Divella, 2005). In particular, workers reporting targeted training are more satisfied on the job, more skilled and generally more productive. The research also reveals the importance of ongoing professional development programs in boosting employee engagement and commitment. Results indicate that the investment in human resource training not only pays individuals to invest in human resources and contribute positively to the performance of organizations. Corporate implications are the importance of adapting training to job requirements and assure on-going learning support for employees. This is a gap in the literature regarding how training programs are related to actual performance.

Keywords

Training and Development, Employee Performance, Organizational Success, Job Satisfaction, Skill Proficiency, Employee Engagement

INTRODUCTION

The pace of change in the business world, driven by technology developments and changes across the globe and in consumer expectations, is forcing companies to focus more keenly than ever on their internal capabilities. And therein lies the significance of organizational efficiency and competitive advantage more than ever. The ongoing

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

efforts to fill a market niche and respond to the market's demands is reflected in the human capital, i.e., in an effective manner of employees' development strategically, an important source of organizational strategic competitiveness. Training and Development (T&D) is one the most popular methods of enhancing employee performance and overall organizational effectiveness. Such programmes are commonly viewed as important for developing the employees' skills, knowledge, and job-related competencies, leading to a positive effect on organisational performance and staff retention.

T&D efforts are designed to provide employees with essential tools required to perform their jobs and help organizations in the accomplishment of their missions. Despite being broad, T&D includes a variety of activities aimed not only at enhancing the technical and functional competencies related to a specific job position, but also interpersonal skills and leadership that facilitates teamwork and creativity. With the expanding focus on learning from an employee performance and organization competitiveness perspective, the reasons why these initiatives work is critical (Aguinis & Kraiger, 2009).

Although there is general agreement on the beneficial influence wielded by T&D initiatives on employee performance, empirical analyses that carefully evaluate the direct effect of these programs have not been very common so far with regard to their impact in terms of performance outcomes (e.g., Onviala et al., 1999). However, the majority of employee development research simply reports that training is conducive to increased job satisfaction, job involvement and commitment (Noe, 2017). Yet there is a lack of research offering conclusive evidence on how particular T&D programmes affect hard aspects of employee performance, such as productivity, skill level and work effectiveness. In general, anecdotal evidence from trainers frequently provides a strong association between T&D and job performance improvement; however this relationship had received limited attention in academic studies. This gap in the literature is what this paper seeks to address by providing evidence from empirical analysis of whether formalised T&D programs are associated with measurable employee performance outcomes.

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

Research Question The main research question underpinning this study is: How effective are training and development programs on employee performance in different sectors? The test investigates how T&D programs can contribute to increasing employee productivity, job satisfaction and organizational commitment. By focusing on the experiences of employees and managers across different sectors, the study seeks to gain insights into the extent to which T experimental research & development programs can be rendered more effective in terms of their direct effects on performance. Furthermore, these studies focused on deciding the factors that moderate the relationship between T&D and performance criteria (job-relatedness of training content, developmental opportunities to use new knowledge/skills, method of instructing for training programs and support informed after training; Salas et al., 2012).

It will also attempt to ascertain the importance of adapting training schemes to better cater for employee and organisational needs. Research implies that generic training for the masses frequently does little to elevate employee productivity. Training that is tailored to the organisation, which meets role requirements, will more likely meet employees problems and therefore has better results (Arthur et al., 2003). Furthermore, ongoing not just one time training is important to maintain performance improvements over time (Tannenbaum et al., 2010). This research will look to see if an on-going customized approach had a more sustained impact on individual employee performance than periodic or generalized training.

Furthermore, the research will explore how different industry sectors interpret T&D and practical approaches to it; in addition, a focus of the study is on potential sector-specific issues (e.g. market demand, technology innovations, and organizational culture) that could impact how training programmes are designed and their effectiveness. For example, in a high-technology industry specialty training may be needed more frequently to keep employees up-to-date with rapid changes, whereas in a customer service industry soft-skills training that improves communication and problem-solving skills could be more beneficial. Analysis of such sectoral variations will assist in customising an organisation's T&D policy to the specificities of its workforce needs and business requirements.

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

This study's results will help in advancing the understanding of human resource management from T&D initiatives by offering substantial empirical evidence for relationship between T&D practices and better employee outcomes. This research seeks to provide valuable guidelines for organizations when they make investments in their human capital by showing how individual T&D programs may influence employee performance, job satisfaction and productivity. The outcomes will also have practical implications for human resource (HR) practitioners, managers and policy makers in designing effective training to facilitate a high performance work environment.

Third, this research emphasizes continuous learning and development as a powerful source for employee engagement and firm success. Challenges for Organizations as they grapple with talent shortages and high employee turnover and increase their focus on innovation, investing in structured, role-specific T&D programme that is ongoing can make them more competitive in the global space. Through providing resources employees need for growth, companies can be sure that their staff is prepared to meet the challenges ahead and perform in such a way as to matter.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Training and development Training and development (T&D) is typically viewed as an important aspect of HRM in organizations that increases the capabilities of employees, such as their knowledge, skills, intelligence, competence performance. T&D programmes are structured to provide employees with tools that make them better at their jobs, ultimately helping the organisation in becoming more productive, satisfied and successful (Noe, 2017). Due to its potential for enhancing the well-being of employees and organizational success, various research works have examined the link between T&D and employee performance with mixed results. According to some scholars, T&D programmes ultimately enhance employee productivity by directly impacting on the skills that are specific to job functions and resulting in improved ways to perform work (Noe, 2017). For instance, the effectiveness of T&D programmes for staffs is often linked to superior task proficiency, increased role clarity and better job performance (Salas, Tannenbaum, Kraiger & Smith-Jentsch, 2012).

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

However, others argue that the spectrum of T&D should be called in question and its influence on skill development challenged. T&D is frequently associated with increases in employee motivation, engagement and organizational commitment which then drive performance outcomes. As Aguinis and Kraiger (2009) suggests, T&D programs can increase EE by proving growth opportunities, development of skills and consequently increase motivation which results in satisfaction. This psychological empowerment not only enhances the ability of employees to perform in their current jobs, but also makes them willing to perform beyond what they are required for organizational success.

In addition, the relevance of T&D in enhancing job satisfaction is also confirmed by Salas et al. workers who went through formal training programmes exhibited significant increases in task performance, job satisfaction and organisational commitment (Konrad et al., 1999). This association implies that T&D programs can serve to increase employee performance and benefit organizational effectiveness by developing a motivated and satisfied work force. And, these increases in employee satisfaction and commitment also frequently lead to better retention rates – employees who feel supported and appreciated by their organizations are less likely to want to leave their company (Kraiger, Ford & Salas, 1993).

Nevertheless, even though these results are very promising and encouraging, an overview of the literature shows that in reality a lot of firms do not succeed to link their T&D activities with the immanent prerequisites from the job or/and organisation at all. Such an inconsistency can reduce the impact of training activities. Arthur et al. (2003) suggested that generic training programmes which do not cater for job role specific needs are often ineffective in terms of achieving better performance. For example, those who follow generic management training may not be able to apply what they have learned in a way that enhances their ability to manage tasks and team work if the training has not been adapted to cover specific challenges facing them at their place of employment. What is clear from the literature is that T&D cannot have a sizeable effect unless the training closely matches job tasks, proficiency level, and organisation performance goals.

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

Further, while much research has been conducted to investigate the short-term effects of T&D programs, there is scant literature addressing their impact in the long-run on employee performance. Training studies typically examine the short-term consequences of participating in a program (e.g., immediate gains in task performance or knowledge acquisition) and neglect how those benefits are sustained across time. This is a gap in the literature as any long-term effects of T&D were essential to demonstrate how continual development programs result in sustained performance improvement. Tannenbaum et al. (2010) concluded that while initial training programmes can result in immediate performance improvements, sustainable success is achieved through continued development and by embedding these aspects of training in the workplace. And if you don't have ongoing learning opportunities, people can just kind of deteriorate in terms of that training they had received and regress to where they were.

Additional investigation of long-term effects of T&D is warranted to more completely characterize the sequelae. Additional research indicates that ongoing development programs, which would incorporate refresher courses and on-the-job learning, may be more effective than a single training session. This type of perpetual program helps ensure that employees are always current in their skills and knowledge—a necessity in industries where new technology and industry standards develop quickly (Aguinis & Kraiger, 2009). Also, the impact of feedback, coaching and performance reviews on making T&D results sustainable is an area that has not been studied. These are factors that can be important in enabling learners to transfer what they have learned and to enhance performance over time (Tannenbaum et al., 2010).

Moreover, the research offers no major insights into potential mediating factors that may link T&D with performance outcomes. Although numerous studies have demonstrated an effect of T&D on employee performance, yet few has undoubtedly concentrated on the mediating mechanisms underlying this relation. For example, person characteristics such as prior knowledge level, learning styles and motivation might affect an employee's training effectiveness (Birdi et al., 2008). Additionally, organizational characteristics such as supervisor support, organizational culture and perceived link between T&D and organisational objectives can have important

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

impacts on the effectiveness of training (Salas et al., 2012). It is important for organizations/employers desiring to formulate training and development programs that are more efficient, cost-effective, focused ones to critically understand these mediators.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study employs a mixed-methods research design, combining both quantitative and qualitative approaches to provide a comprehensive understanding of the impact of training and development (T&D) programs on employee performance. The mixed-methods design is chosen for its ability to capture both the numerical data that reveal general trends and the qualitative insights that help explain the underlying mechanisms and contexts of these trends (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2017). By combining these two methodologies, this study aims to produce a more robust analysis of the T&D-performance relationship, addressing both the measurable outcomes and the perceptions of key stakeholders.

The quantitative component involves a survey administered to 250 employees drawn from a diverse range of industries, including manufacturing, service, and technology sectors. The objective of the survey is to assess employees' participation in T&D programs and their perceived improvements in job performance as a result of the training. Participants are selected using a random sampling technique, which ensures that the sample is representative of various demographic characteristics such as age, gender, job role, and industry, thus enhancing the generalizability of the findings (Fink, 2017).

The survey consists of several sections designed to capture key information about the frequency, relevance, and impact of T&D programs on employee performance. Likert-scale questions will assess the following dimensions: the frequency of training, the perceived relevance of the training content to employees' job roles, and self-reported changes in performance outcomes such as productivity, skill improvement, and job satisfaction. Additionally, questions will explore employees' perceptions of the quality and delivery methods of training programs, including online training, in-person sessions, and on-the-job training (Noe, 2017).

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

The quantitative data collected will be analyzed using statistical methods, particularly regression analysis, to identify any significant correlations between T&D participation and performance indicators. Regression analysis is ideal for this type of research as it allows for the examination of the relationship between independent variables (such as frequency and type of training) and dependent variables (such as productivity, job satisfaction, and skill improvement) (Hair et al., 2010). This analysis will help determine the strength and direction of the relationship between T&D and employee performance and identify any key factors that mediate this relationship.

In addition to the survey, the qualitative component of the study will involve in-depth, semi-structured interviews with 20 managers and human resource (HR) professionals. These interviews aim to provide a more nuanced understanding of the organizational context surrounding T&D programs and explore how these programs are designed, implemented, and perceived by those responsible for them. Interviews will focus on the specific factors that contribute to the effectiveness of T&D programs, including alignment with job requirements, program content, delivery methods, and post-training support (Salas et al., 2012).

The qualitative data will be analyzed using thematic analysis, a widely used method for identifying and interpreting patterns in qualitative data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). This approach will allow for the identification of key themes related to the design, implementation, and perceived outcomes of T&D programs. For example, themes may emerge around the challenges HR professionals face when aligning training with organizational goals or the factors that influence employees' engagement with training programs. Thematic analysis will provide deeper insights into the organizational practices that affect the success of T&D initiatives and help explain the results observed in the quantitative phase of the study.

To ensure a representative and diverse sample, the study employs random sampling for both the survey and the interviews. The survey sample of 250 employees will be drawn from different industries to capture a broad range of experiences with T&D programs. This sampling method helps mitigate selection bias and ensures that the findings are not skewed toward a particular demographic or industry type (Fink, 2017). The interview sample of 20 managers and HR professionals will be selected

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

based on their involvement in T&D programs and their ability to provide valuable insights into the organizational practices and perceptions that influence training effectiveness.

The quantitative data will be analyzed using regression analysis to explore the relationships between T&D participation and key performance indicators, such as job satisfaction, productivity, and skill improvement. This statistical approach is appropriate for identifying correlations and examining the extent to which variations in T&D programs can explain differences in employee performance (Hair et al., 2010). The qualitative data from the interviews will be analyzed using thematic analysis, which involves coding the data and identifying recurring themes that highlight important factors in the design and effectiveness of T&D programs (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Thematic analysis will allow for the exploration of the organizational dynamics and individual experiences that may not be captured through quantitative methods, providing a richer understanding of the factors that contribute to the success of T&D initiatives.

There are several limitations to this study. One key limitation is the reliance on self-reported data from survey respondents, which may introduce bias, as employees may overstate or understate the impact of training on their performance (Podsakoff et al., 2003). Additionally, since the study focuses on a specific geographical region, the findings may not be fully generalizable to other contexts, especially in countries with different cultural attitudes toward T&D or varying industry standards. Furthermore, the study relies on employees' perceptions of the training they have received, which may not always align with objective performance metrics.

Despite these limitations, the mixed-methods approach provides a comprehensive perspective on the impact of T&D on employee performance, combining the statistical rigor of quantitative analysis with the depth and contextual richness of qualitative insights.

RESULTS

The results of this study indicate a strong positive correlation between participation in training and development (T&D) programs and improvements in employee performance, aligning with existing literature that underscores the significant impact

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

of T&D on various performance outcomes (Noe, 2017; Salas et al., 2012). The quantitative survey data reveal that a substantial majority of employees—85% of respondents—reported that T&D programs enhanced their job skills and overall productivity. This finding is consistent with previous studies that suggest that structured training improves employees' task proficiency and technical expertise, which in turn enhances their ability to perform job tasks efficiently (Aguinis & Kraiger, 2009). By acquiring specific skills tailored to their job roles, employees are able to carry out their responsibilities with greater competence, leading to an observable increase in productivity.

Furthermore, 75% of respondents indicated that T&D positively influenced their job satisfaction and motivation. This finding supports the argument that training programs are not just about improving technical skills but also play a crucial role in fostering employee engagement and commitment. As Aguinis and Kraiger (2009) highlight, training programs that enhance an employee's skills and abilities can also foster a sense of accomplishment and self-efficacy, thereby improving job satisfaction. When employees feel equipped to perform their roles successfully, they are more likely to be motivated and satisfied with their work, which in turn contributes to better organizational outcomes, such as higher productivity and retention rates (Birdi et al., 2008).

In analyzing the type of training programs received by employees, the study further reveals that those who participated in targeted training—programs specifically designed for their job roles—experienced a more significant improvement in performance compared to employees who received generic, one-size-fits-all training programs. Specifically, employees who received training tailored to their job responsibilities reported higher levels of task competence, skill proficiency, and overall job performance. This finding corroborates the work of Arthur et al. (2003), who argue that training programs that align closely with the specific demands of the job are more likely to result in meaningful improvements in performance. Tailored training ensures that the content is relevant and applicable to the unique challenges employees face in their roles, which maximizes the effectiveness of the training and facilitates more immediate and practical performance gains.

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

The qualitative data obtained from interviews with 20 managers and human resource professionals offer additional insights that further substantiate the findings from the survey. Eighty percent of the managers interviewed acknowledged that well-structured T&D programs were instrumental in improving employee efficiency and performance. Managers noted that training programs designed to meet the specific needs of employees not only enhanced individual performance but also contributed to the overall effectiveness of teams and departments. The managers also emphasized that providing employees with the necessary training helps them perform tasks more efficiently, reduces errors, and increases the quality of their output, all of which have a direct positive impact on organizational performance.

In addition, the interviews revealed that continuous professional development is a key factor in maintaining long-term employee engagement and performance improvement. While initial training programs can lead to short-term performance gains, managers stressed that ongoing development opportunities are critical for sustaining high levels of employee performance over time. As Tannenbaum et al. (2010) suggest, continuous learning ensures that employees stay updated with the latest skills and knowledge relevant to their roles, which is particularly important in industries that undergo rapid changes due to technological advancements or evolving market demands. Continuous professional development programs also foster a culture of lifelong learning, which helps employees remain adaptable and engaged throughout their careers.

Moreover, many managers reported that T&D programs also had a positive impact on employee retention. This aligns with findings from Kraiger, Ford, and Salas (1993), who argue that organizations that invest in employee development create a positive work environment that enhances employee satisfaction and reduces turnover. Managers highlighted that when employees feel valued and supported through continuous development opportunities, they are more likely to stay with the organization, reducing the costs associated with recruitment and turnover.

DISCUSSION

Results of the study are supportive of an increasingly popular view within human resource management that T&D programs are instrumental in improving employee

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

performance and contribute to increased sales and profitability among firms more generally. The results of the current study validate the hypothesis that participation in T&D makes job performance better and this is consistent with various established theories as well as empirical studies. In particular, the positive association between training participation and better employee job performance demonstrates the immediate advantage of providing employees with what they need to perform well (i.e., skills, knowledge, confidence) in their respective roles (Aguinis & Kraiger, 2009). Such results are consistent with prior findings emphasizing that T&D plays an important role in short-term and long-term performance enhancements (Salas et al., 2012).

This also lends credence to the idea that role-specific, targeted training programmes provide the best performance returns. This is consistent with the observation of Arthur et al. (2003), suggesting that the return on training investments can be greatly improved if its content is tailored to accommodate tasks and level of responsibilities of employees according to their work profile. Workers who took job-related training in the study were far more likely to feel they had advanced in their job as opposed to those who attended general, one-size-fits-all programs. This indicates that training programs must pay specific attention to realistic, task-relevant skills that help employees deal with pressing issues they face in their working lives.

This study also provides further supporting evidence for the need for continuous training in order to sustain and enhance employee performance. As the findings from this study demonstrate, employees who were able to take advantage of continuous development opportunities saw longer-term enhanced job performance. This is in line with Tannenbaum and colleagues (2010) who posit the pre-service training of staff can lead to performance improvement in the short term, but an ongoing development process will keep employees abreast with industry trends and fill any gaps in job skills. Employers who provide development opportunities create a culture where employees feel appreciated and supported in their desire to get ahead. It has the flow-on effect of creating greater job satisfaction, engagement and motivation, because employees can see a clear route to progress and be challenges to grow in their roles (Noe, 2017).

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

The implications for practice of this study are profound for organizations that aim to shift employee performance or the overall effectiveness of organization. First, they need to focus on the personalization of training programs so that they are tailored as per the individual requirements arising out of different job roles. As a result, organisations can ensure the highest relevance and effectiveness of the training investment, leading to improved performance results. Especially in those industries that require some degree of expertise or skill, like technology and health care, employees must be trained to learn different tools, processes and codes which change so frequently (Kraiger et al., 1993). Even where roles are more generic the effectiveness of training can be improved by making content relevant to the actual issues faced by staff.

But in addition to that, the focus of the organization must also be on development as a never-ending process and not just an event at one point in time. Providing workers with access to workshops, certifications and leadership programs will keep them current as new technology in the industry is introduced. Research by Tannenbaum et al. (2010) insist that organisations which invest in long-term training and development programmes are more likely to create a learning and continuous learning corporate culture, thus promoting better performance across all employees. Moreover, giving employees access to mentorship or coaching as part of their professional development may reinforce the training they get and foster more sustained learning experiences (Salas et al., 2012).

Moreover, organizations need to potentialize a learning and development culture at all levels of the organization. When there's a strong learning culture, people want to learn and develop for themselves; they don't feel it's being done to them. When T&D, is deeply rooted in an organization's culture it communicates to employees that their growth has value which can very well raise morale and increase retention (Kraiger et al., 1993). Such a climate is also conducive to innovation and workplace collaboration since employees are more likely to share new ideas or solutions, when they feel comfortable about their skills and have the resources to test out new ways of doing things.

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

In summary, the winners will effectively say that their investment has paid off in terms of performance to employees and employee investments provide benefits to the organization. Effective training programs not only improve individual employee performance but they also support organizational success and effectiveness. According to the outcomes of the study, employees experiencing T&D would be more likely to exhibit increased productivity, enhanced problem-solving skills, and higher levels of satisfaction with their jobs. When taken together, those individual improvements result in better organizational performance, more innovation, and lower turnovers. Research by Birdi et al. (2008) indicate that companies investing in employees' development enjoy higher levels of employee retention and engagement, also resulting in more stable and productive workforce.

CONCLUSION

Employee performance is also enhanced through T&D and this study further supports the significance of T&D on employee performance. The results support that well-designed, personalized and continuous training programs make a significant difference in improving job satisfaction, skill development and overall performance. Staff who received job-specific T&D were perceived as more competent and satisfied, supporting the argument that T&D should be specialise to take account of the unique demands of each job (Arthur et al., 2003). Further, open-ended growth opportunities were also found to continue to make a significant contribution toward long-term performance increases and underpin the belief that in order to foster employee engagement and achieve organizational success continued learning on-the-job is critical (Tannenbaum et al., 2010).

Through focused and ongoing efforts, organizations can improve the performance of individual employees while building a high-performance work culture that will create a number of positive organizational results including greater efficiencies and lower turnover numbers. Organizations that invest in the development of their employees are likely to have more engaged and retained employees since engagement is a key factor conducive to long-term business success (Kraiger, Ford, & Salas, 1993).

Despite these, the current study is not without limitations – being limited to workers in a specific region and using self-reported data both indicates that potential biases

may have been introduced and findings are not generalizable to other regions or fields. Our study has focused on the short-term impact of T&D programs for SALT, yet future research may wish to consider how the long-term consequence of such policies varies across industries and whether certain sectors benefit more or less from this investment in training. Also, additional inquiries might test the importance of leadership for successful T&D initiatives [since] supportiveness of supervisors has been found to be closely associated to success in training efforts (Noe, 2017). By filling these gaps, future research can aid the development of a more detailed picture of how T&D may help to support sustained organisational success.

REFERENCES

- Arthur, W., Bennett, W., Edens, P. S., & Bell, S. T. (2003). Effectiveness of training in organizations: A meta-analytic review. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 88(2), 234-245. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.88.2.234>
- Aguinis, H., & Kraiger, K. (2009). Benefits of training and development for individuals and teams, organizations, and society. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 60, 451-474. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.60.110707.163505>
- Birdi, K., Allan, C., & Warr, P. (2008). Correlates and consequences of work-related learning in organizations. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 93(4), 1014-1022. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.93.4.1014>
- Creswell, J. W., & Plano Clark, V. L. (2017). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research* (3rd ed.). Sage publications.
- Fink, A. (2017). *How to conduct surveys: A step-by-step guide* (6th ed.). Sage publications.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2010). *Multivariate data analysis* (7th ed.). Pearson.
- Kraiger, K., Ford, J. K., & Salas, E. (1993). Application of cognitive, skill-based, and affective theories of learning outcomes to new methods of training evaluation. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 78(2), 311-328. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.78.2.311>
- Noe, R. A. (2017). *Employee training and development* (7th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.

Pakistan Journal of Management & Social Science

<https://pakistanjournalofmanagement.com/index.php/Journal>

Podsakoff, P. M., MacKenzie, S. B., Lee, J. Y., & Podsakoff, N. P. (2003). Common method biases in behavioral research: A critical review of the literature and recommended remedies. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 88(5), 879-903.

<https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.88.5.879>

Salas, E., Tannenbaum, S. I., Kraiger, K., & Smith-Jentsch, K. A. (2012). The science of training and development in organizations: What matters in practice. *Psychological Science in the Public Interest*, 13(2), 74-101.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1529100612436661>

Tannenbaum, S. I., Beard, R. L., & Salas, E. (2010). The influence of feedback on training effectiveness: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 95(3), 564-577. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0017885>